

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
October 27 and November 3, 2016

OCTOBER 27 MEETING

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler (Chair), Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Brian Crane, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor and Charles Wilson.

AGENDA

HISTORIC DESIGNATION NOMINATION

Old Naval Observatory, Case 11-21, 2300 E Street/2301 Constitution Avenue NW.

The Board designated Observatory Hill, at 2300 E Street NW/2301 Constitution Avenue NW, as a historic district in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites, and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places for listing as a district of national importance with a Period of Significance of 1844-1961. Observatory Hill was found to meet all seven criteria for D.C. Designation and all four National Register Criteria. Vote: 7-0.

WASHINGTON HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT

1800 Columbia Road NW, HPA 16-388, revised concept/new construction.

The Board found the project compatible and made recommendations for further refinement. The Board considered and gave great weight to the points raised in the ANC resolution, and engaged in substantive discussion with the ANC representative on those points as was discussed on the record. After deliberating on and giving great weight to the three ANC recommendations, the Board came to the following conclusions:

I. Disagreed with the ANC recommendation that the height and scale needed to be further reduced. The Board found the ANC interpretation of the Board's design guidelines for new construction unduly restrictive. The cited guidelines 4.1, 4.2, and 8.1 through 8.3 state that the scale of a new building should usually respect the prevailing scale, noting some conditions that might make a difference in scale appropriate, and suggesting possible variations of at least two stories in some locations. The Board cited the prominence of the large site at a broad, open intersection that creates a symbolic center to the neighborhood as a condition that allows for some additional height and presence in order to give more of a sense of place. For such a large and prominent site, the Board found the scale compatible with the context on Columbia Road, which includes large apartment buildings. It also noted that along 18th Street, the design incorporates setbacks, step-downs, scale-giving secondary elements such as oriels, and a contrast in materials to provide an appropriate and successful transition within the building to the lower scale of the 18th Street context. The Board found this transition consistent with the Comprehensive Plan policy on transitions in building intensity.

II. *Disagreed with the ANC recommendation that the setback should be increased on the corner.* The Board's design guideline 2.1 promotes alignment of facades with the street walls of the adjacent historic context. The Board noted that the revised design increases the amount of the proposed façade aligned on the historic building line on Columbia Road, and the projecting bays mimic the width and alignment of projecting bays along 18th Street. The guideline does not apply to non-historic setbacks such as the existing plaza at 18th and Columbia.

III. *Agreed in part with the ANC recommendation that the proportion, rhythm and massing of building elements needs to be brought into better consistency with the adjacent properties.* The Board's guidelines 5.1, 6.1, and 7.1 are interrelated and promote respect for the character of adjacent structures in building elements such as windows and doors, projecting bays, storefronts, and roof structures. The Board found the massing and spacing of bay projections and windows generally appropriate, but recommended refinement of elements such as: 1) the scale and detailing of the bays, windows, and storefronts of the red brick portion of the building along 18th Street, to add a finer-grained expression and more intimate scale that relates better to the character of that street; 2) the penthouse, to make it simpler and more understated in terms of sightlines, placement, and the character of materials; and 3) the overall design character of the building and plaza, to avoid a generic, lackluster, or hard-edged appearance, and to make them more evocative of the neighborhood and more appealing and friendly to pedestrians in the neighborhood.

Vote: 6-0-1 (Davidson abstained).

KALORAMA TRIANGLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1815 Columbia Road NW, HPA 16-160, concept/new construction.

The Board found the concept incompatible with the character of the Kalorama Triangle Historic District and inconsistent with the purposes of the preservation act. The Board gave great weight to and concurred with the points raised in the ANC resolution. Vote: 5-0 (Davidson recused).

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1626 Riggs Place NW, HPA 16-617, concept/three-story rear addition and roof deck.

The Board found the concept generally consistent with the preservation act and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act with the following provisions: (1) The rear addition be only 1 story in height; (2) the applicant maintain the rear brick wall of the original house and incorporate it into the existing design, and document how the extent of demolition will not result in substantial demolition; and; (3) the applicant to provide a detailed restoration report for the front elevation; and (4) to delegate final approval to staff. The Board agreed with the ANC resolution condition to limit the addition to 1 story in height. Vote: 7-0

1630 Riggs Place NW, HPA 16-608, concept/three-story rear addition and roof deck.

The Board found the concept generally consistent with the preservation act and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act with the following provisions: (1) The rear addition be only 1 story in height; (2) the applicant maintain the rear brick wall of the original house and incorporate it into the existing design, and document how the extent of demolition will not result in substantial demolition; and; (3) the applicant to provide a detailed restoration report for the front elevation, and documentation of the outhouse and (4) and delegate final design review to staff. The Board agreed with the ANC resolution condition to reduce the addition to one-story in height. Vote: 7-0

2147-2149 P Street NW, HPA 16-528, concept/new five-story rear addition.

The Board found the concept generally consistent with the historic district and consistent with the preservation act and recommended that the applicant highlight underpinning information to HPO and neighbors, and delegated final approval to staff. The Board gave great weight to and concurred with the many of the points raised in the ANC resolution as was discussed on the record. Vote: 7-0
Vote: 7-1

1500 17th Street NW, HPA 16-686, concept/new construction.

The Board found the concept to be generally compatible with the character of the historic district, but that revisions are needed to the color of the materials and to the massing, materials and fenestration of the corner tower and delegated final approval to staff. The Board gave great weight to and concurred with the many of the points raised in the ANC resolution as was discussed on the record. Vote: 7-0

NOVEMBER 3 MEETING

Present: Andrew Aurbach (Acting Chair), Rauzia Ally, Brian Crane, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor and Charles Wilson. Absent: Gretchen Pfaehler (Chair).

AGENDA

ANACOSTIA HISTORIC DISTRICT

2100 Martin Luther King Jr. Avenue SE, HPA 16-687, concept/new construction.

The Board found the concept not yet compatible in that it is not sufficiently contextual with the houses of V Street. The Board did not object to the footprint of the building but generally supported instead a three-story building (with one member suggesting a four-story main block and three-story east wing). The Board discouraged the use of metal panels and such a stark color contrast as in the bays, and recommended reducing the number of materials and planes on the façade. The Board requested more development of and information on the landscape (including fencing) and the materials of the building. The Board was informed that Advisory Neighborhood Commission 8A has passed a resolution on the project, but had not received the resolution in order to give it great weight. Vote: 6-0.

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1761 N Street NW, HPA 16-684, concept/four-story addition at rear.

The Board approved the concept generally consistent with the historic district and consistent with the preservation act, and delegated final approval to staff, but that the rear addition behind 1761 needed be lowered in height and/or further pulled back to eliminate or reduce its visibility from street view, and that the new stair and elevator should be relocated in the new construction rather than in the historic building to reduce the amount of demolition. The Board gave great weight to and concurred with the points raised in the ANC resolution as was discussed on the record. Vote: 5-1.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

1116 Constitution Avenue NE, HPA 16-526, concept/rear and roof additions.

The Board approved concept to be compatible with the Capitol Hill Historic District, with the revisions that the rear addition be reduced to two-stories, the applicant work with staff to refine the proportions, placement and sizing of the fenestration at the rear addition, and explore maintaining the masonry volume of the garage. The Board was informed that Advisory

Neighborhood Commission 6A had seen the proposal, but had not received the resolution in order to give it great weight. Vote: 4-3.

119 7th Street SE, HPA 16-692, concept/rear addition,

The Board approved the concept to be compatible with the Capitol Hill Historic District, and directed the applicant to further study the massing and details at the front façade and rooftop design. The Board gave great weight to and concurred with the points raised in the ANC resolution. Vote: 7-0.

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

1842-1844 Monroe Street NW, HPA 16-618, concept/subdivision, new construction.

The Board approved the subdivision and supported the concept of two “flats” buildings, but it found the proposal for new construction to be insufficiently contextual with Monroe Street’s historic pattern of development and that it should be revised to address the issues raised in the staff report. Other approaches recommended included trying to recreate the massing of the double house that once stood on the lots, and studying the few 25-foot-wide rowhouses in the historic district. Suggestions included creating repeating—rather than mirror-image—units; narrowing and further projecting the bays; having less symmetry; perhaps introducing a mansard roof to lower the top floor; and eliminating or reducing the use of double-ganged windows on the facades. Vote: 7-0.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

2213 14th Street NW, HPA 16-699, concept/alterations and addition to non-contributing building.

The Board found the design incompatible with the historic district and directed the applicant to further study the massing and façade design. Vote: 5-2.

HISTORIC DESIGNATION NOMINATION

Union Market Terminal, parts of 1200 and 1300 blocks of 4th and 5th Streets and of the 400 and 500 blocks of Morse Street NE.

The Board voted to designate Union Market Terminal as an historic district in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended forwarding the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places. The property meets National Register Criteria A and C at the local level of Significance with a Period of Significance of 1929-1939. The Board gave great weight to the resolution of the ANC but noted that the proposed design guidelines could not be considered without public notice being provided, and asked that those return for review by the Board after further coordination with the community and public notice being provided. Vote: 5 to 2.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following items on the consent calendar on October 26 by a vote of 7-0 (Taylor absent).

HISTORIC DESIGNATION NOMINATION

Financial Historic District technical amendment/boundary expansion adjustment, Case 16-12.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Equitable Cooperative Building Association, 915 F Street NW (landmark including interior), HPA 16-565, concept/new interior mezzanine.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

219 9th Street SE, HPA 16-612, concept/second story addition to one-story garage.
732 3rd Street NE, HPA 16-634, concept/new carriage house.
730 3rd Street NE, HPA 16-633, concept/new carriage house.
1109 D Street SE, HPA 16-682, concept/two-story carriage house.

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3401 34th Place NW, HPA 16-680, concept/add dormer window, enlarge existing bay.
3310 Ordway Street NW, HPA 16-628, concept/alterations and addition to non-contributing building.

14TH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1316 R Street NW, HPA 16-564, concept/three story rear addition.

GEORGETOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT

1662 34th Street NW, HPA 16-668, two-story rear addition.

GRANT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

7 Grant Circle NW, HPA 16-614, concept/three-story rear addition and roof deck.

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

448 M Street NW, HPA #16-625, concept/rear addition, three stories plus penthouse.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1442 T Street NW, HPA 16-677, concept/renewal of 2014 HPRB concept approval.

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Neal R. Gross & Co., Inc., (202) 234-4433, www.nealrgross.com or info@nealrgross.com. Individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <http://planning.dc.gov>